

Appendix 1 – feedback from businesses and a summary analysis of responses to questionnaires.

Summary analysis of responses to questionnaires

A total of 750 questionnaires were distributed to businesses in Muswell Hill, Crouch End and Green Lanes. The Green Lanes Traders asked for an additional 300 questionnaires which they distributed within the Green Lanes area. A further 750 were placed on vehicles parked in pay & display bays in those town centres over a period of three weeks ensuring that our target audience was reached. The Council received a total of 259 responses; of those 146 were returned by businesses and 113 from individual motorists

1. When asked to each (visitors) of the three local town centres what town centres or shopping centres they mainly used.

Crouch End

- 41% of visitors to Crouch End also use Muswell Hill
- 32% use Brent Cross
- 18% use Westfield

Green Lanes

- 32% of visitors to Green Lanes also use Wood Green
- loyalties are then split more or less evenly between the Arena centre (Green Lanes), Tottenham, Seven Sisters, Brent Cross and Westfield.

Muswell Hill

- 52% of Muswell Hill visitors go to Brent Cross
- 39% also go to Crouch End

2. When asked how frequently those visitors visit those town centres (the average for all three town centres).

- 52% reported most days
- 29% reported weekly
- 18 % reported monthly

The response to the 2011 survey

- 41% reported most days.
- 36% reported weekly
- 20% reported monthly

This indicates an increase in those visiting our town centres on a daily basis.

3. When asked how long it took those visitors to drive to those town centres.

- 58%. that it took less than 15 minutes
- 29% reported that it took 15-30 minutes
- 13% reported that it longer than 30 minutes

The response to the 2011 survey

- 54%. that it took less than 15 minutes

- 32% reported that it took 15-30 minutes
- 14% reported that it longer than 30 minutes

This indicates that the majority of those visiting those town centres are local to that area.

4. When asked how easy it generally to find a parking space.

- 9% reported that it was quite easy
- 25% reported that they could usually find a space
- 60% reported that they found it difficult. This % was higher in Crouch End at 74%

The response to the **2011 survey**

- 13% reported that it was quite easy
- 36% reported that they could usually find a space
- 76% reported that they found it difficult. This % was higher in Green Lanes at 82%

5. When Businesses were asked what their customers say about parking.

- 57% reported that their customers complain mostly about the difficulty in finding an available parking space. This % was higher in Crouch End at 68%
- 55% reported that customers complain about the level of charges; however this % was much higher Green Lanes at 71%
- 16 % reported that customers complain that there are not enough spaces close to all shops and restaurants
- 12% reported that customers complain about the clarity of parking restriction signage
- 33% inconvenient not being able to park for more than 2 hours

The response to the **2011 survey**

- 63% reported that their customers complain mostly about the difficulty in finding an available parking space
- 43% reported that customers complain that there are not enough spaces close to all shops and restaurants
- 24% reported that customers complain about the level of charges; however this % was much higher Green Lanes at 41%.
- 23% reported that customers complain about the clarity of parking restriction signage
- 17% inconvenient not being able to park for more than 2 hours

6. When visitors were asked what the most important aspect of parking was.

- 55% felt that the ability to quickly find a parking space was most important. This % was higher at 65% in Crouch End.
- 61% felt that parking charges were most important. However this % was disproportionately higher in Green Lanes at 83%, with 55% in Crouch End and 45% in Muswell Hill.
- 19% felt that the ability to park for more than 2 hours was most important
- 23% felt that clear and simple signage was most important

The response to the **2011 survey**

- 63% felt that the ability to quickly find a parking space was most important.
- 46% felt that parking charges were most important; however this % was disproportionately higher in Green lanes at 62% and Tottenham and Seven Sisters at 54%.
- 27% felt that the ability to park for more than 2 hours was most important.
- 34% felt that clear and simple signage was most important

The biggest priority issue for visitors to Crouch End and Muswell Hill is still the availability of parking spaces, outweighing concerns about the level of parking charges.

7. When Businesses were asked how long their customers generally want to park for.

- 33% reported that customers needed to park for two hours or more.

The response to the **2011 survey**

- 35% reported that customers needed to park for two hours or more,

8. When visitors were asked how long they generally want to park for;

- 26% reported that they needed to park for about half an hour
- 45% reported that they needed to park for one to two hours.

The response to the **2011 survey**

- 16% reported that they needed to park for about half an hour
- 57% reported that they needed to park for one to two hours. The % was higher in Crouch End (67%), Green Lanes (50%) Muswell Hill (54%).

9. When visitors were asked why they decided to travel by car.

- 66% reported that car was more convenient
- 42% reported that public transport was not practical
- 8% reported that public transport links were poor
- 8% reported that it worked out cheaper to use the car

The response to the **2011 survey**

- 44% reported that car was more convenient
- 41% reported that public transport was not practical because of need the carry heavy shopping
- 4% reported that public transport links were poor
- 4% reported that it worked out cheaper to use the car

10. Businesses were asked to say how many of their staff drive in to work

The average overall was just over 2 members of staff per business who drive in to work. The majority of those individuals park on street adding to the parking pressures experienced in those town centres. This is higher than expected due to the fact that parking provision in those town centres is generally prioritised for residents and their visitors and pay & display users, apart from the uncontrolled free parking available in

residential streets in Muswell Hill and outside the CPZ hours in Crouch End. This is likely to influence business views on the availability of parking spaces and parking charges.

When asked whether or not businesses agreed that customers should have parking priority; the majority of businesses tended to agree however, 37% of businesses in Crouch End did not agree that customers or visitors should have parking priority and 20% of Green Lanes businesses also disagreed with the suggestion.

11. Businesses were asked to consider how the current economic climate is affecting trade.

- 55% stated that Customers were more likely to go to shopping malls
- 45% Customers made fewer visits than they did last year
- 38% Cost of parking had put off many customers and visitors
- 26% Visitors park for shorter periods
- 16% Shortage of convenient parking space is a problem

12. Visitors were asked how the current economic climate affected their visits to those town centres

- 38% stated that they come less often
- 36% stated that they go to centres like Brent Cross
- 29% stated that it hasn't really changed how often they visit
- 29% stated that they park for a shorter time
- 14% stated that they do a lot more shopping on the internet
- 12% stated that the range and type of shops are changing

Additional feedback received directly from Businesses and Traders

Green Lanes Traders association

Our initial concerns about the high cost of parking expressed last year has now become a reality on Green Lanes. It's one of the contributing factors that is causing the major decline and collapse of retail (A1) businesses. In an ideal world local shops for local people and parking is for outsiders, the fact is during daytime hours, the 'locals' are at work (which is good because they have to earn the money first!), and it's this daytime economy that is being eroded. Being busy just on weekends is not enough to sustain all the expenses on GLs, and businesses just can't survive on 2 days a week. Shoppers in the current climate are looking after their every penny!

This situation will no doubt topple the balance between the numbers of A1/A3 split within the Council's UDP guidelines, and this will take many years to rebuild the retail confidence again. Clearly here is an ideal opportunity for the Council to manage the Green Lanes situation. We are unlike any of the other Haringey town centres, and we urge you to reconsider the current parking fee in light of these impacts, and consider the suggestions of Ian Sygrave's letter.

Rob & Shef

From: rob@tao [mailto:rob@taosport.co.uk]

We are very concerned with the under utilisation on the parking bays for Green Lanes high street since the increase earlier this year and we are looking to the Council for help. We believe that if the Council can decrease the parking charges from £3 p/h to £2 p/h, this will increase parking revenue with higher turnover of bays, and it will bring the much needed

trade to our high street. We would like to suggest it as a pilot scheme with a review at the end.

We will be happy to meet and discuss this further before updating our traders as promised.

With regards

Rob & Shef

Harringay Traders Association

c/o 523 Green Lanes, Harringay, London N4 1AN

m: 07810 308867

t: 020 8348 0870

www.harringay4shops.com <<http://www.harringay4shops.com/>>

www.harringayfoodfestival.com <<http://www.harringayfoodfestival.com/>>

Est. since 1986

Winners of 2006 & 2010 Haringey's Safer Communities Awards

Letter from Green Lanes Traders dated 30 March 2012 also appended to this document.

Parking Consultation - response by Ladder Community Safety Partnership

The Ladder Community Safety Partnership (LCSP) is an umbrella organisation, representing numerous Residents= Associations and Neighbourhood Watches and aims to represent the views and concerns of local residents in the Ladder and Green Lanes area of Haringey, as expressed in our regular monthly meetings and updates.

Residents have asked the LCSP to write to you regarding this consultation because of the important issues which it raises for Green Lanes. In particular, we are writing to express our concern that the present parking system is harming the economic health and vitality of our local town centre, Green Lanes. Our major concern is the well-being of the daytime economy, particularly the survival of A1 related outlets. These businesses rely on a regular and consistent daytime trade and are clearly being penalised by the existing regulations.

There is a Pay and Display system in operation from 8am until 6.30pm (Ladder and Garden roads) and until 7pm (in Green Lanes), priced at £3/hour, or 5p per minute. As it is difficult to predict exactly how long shopping may take, most customers err on the side of caution and go for the £3 option. This is simply too expensive for a centre which is offering basic, low-cost items, and adds a sizeable percentage to the overall spend, thereby deterring potential customers.

By contrast in Crouch End free parking is always available in adjacent residential roads as residents-only parking is restricted to 2 hours (weekdays only), the periods of which are staggered to the east and west of the centre. The situation in Muswell Hill is similar. Equally, Wood Green has a cheap multi-storey facility, while parking at the Arena Shopping Centre is free, but only for their customers. This means that Green Lanes is effectively surrounded by more cost-effective shopping venues and it is at a serious disadvantage. Shops are closing down and/or relocating, while restaurants - unaffected by charges as evening parking is free - are constantly expanding, leaving local residents with fewer and fewer retail choices.

For example, at the moment (May 2012) four A3 restaurants in Green Lanes are applying to LBH Planning for change of use to double in size at the expense of adjacent A1 retail outlets. Long -established businesses such as CG Gas, Cyplon Travel Agents and Steph & Xenon's Barbers (all extremely useful and varied services for local residents) are about to close and relocate to more friendly parking environments, often outside the borough. We

know that several other shops are also on a knife-edge, and on the verge of closing. All have specified the loss of day-time trade - the result of a punitive parking system - as a key factor.

It cannot be in anyone's interest for this to continue - the borough is losing small businesses, residents are losing valued services and the day-time economy is collapsing.

We accept that the overall economic climate is a harsh one, but the parking regime is something over which the Council can and does have control, and if it does nothing it risks killing the goose laying the golden eggs of parking revenue. It should surely anyway be doing everything in its power to help struggling shops - and to support its own UDP which explicitly highlights the importance of the vitality and viability of the daytime economy in Haringey's High Streets.

Unless there is a change of policy, this spiral of decline will intensify and Green Lanes will simply become a high street full of restaurants (which benefit from free evening parking) interspersed with a number of other non-retail premises, such as betting shops and estate agents.

This need not happen, although much damage has already been done. Given the gravity of the situation the Council should be prepared to address the problem by a simple change to its parking policy for the Green Lanes area. There are several obvious options/alterations to save Green Lanes as a local high street, with a flourishing day-time economy.

(a) offer a clearly defined period, eg 11am-2pm, of free parking on Green Lanes and the adjacent CPZs, subject of course to appropriate consultation (still less generous than Crouch End or Muswell Hill, but enough to make a significant and positive impact).

(b) offer free parking after 1pm on Saturdays (this is already the case in key shopping areas of Islington, Enfield and Barnet)

(c) offer a reduced fee of £2/hour, perhaps at specified times (still not cheap, but would obviously encourage shoppers who are purchasing low value items)

Any one, or combination of, these suggestions would have a positive impact by encouraging more day-time shoppers to visit Green Lanes and spend money in our local shops.

We very much hope the Council will give urgent consideration to these suggestions. There can be no doubt that Green Lanes shopkeepers are being treated harshly in comparison to other areas by this 'one size fits all' parking system which fails to take into account wider free parking opportunities elsewhere.

In conclusion, we would stress that we are not asking for special treatment for local shopkeepers. Rather, we are seeking fair and equal treatment with other comparable town centres in the borough, all of which benefit from a more favourable parking regime than that which presently operates in the Green Lanes area.

Muswell Hill Businesses and Traders

I'm writing in support of Emma Whittlestone's email to you dated 25th April.

I'm a very small independent retailer in Muswell Hill struggling to survive. Since Haringey Council in their wisdom decided to increase parking charges, there has been a marked difference in trade in Muswell Hill. My customers now think twice about making the effort to travel to MH and when they do, they are time watching. There have never been so many empty spaces in the parking bays.

By comparison St John's Wood High Road, which is a very affluent area as you know, has much more sensible parking charges of £1.20 per hour as opposed to £3 in our borough.

Haringey also refuse to put money into any kind of regeneration in MH and I therefore feel that the hike in parking is unfair and totally unjustified.

I know our neighbouring Barnet council also increased their parking fees and also changed to pay by phone only which has completely killed trade so I hope Haringey do not opt for this too. No thought went to the elderly who find it difficult to use this facility.

You are being urged to reconsider these unsustainable fees on many fronts and would appreciate to be kept updated on all consultations taking place on this subject. We are members of the MHTG and attend most meetings where these issues are discussed on numerous occasions.

Thank you for taking the time to read my email.

Martha Behiri
Aziza boutique
27 Fortis Green Road
Muswell Hill
London
N10 3HP

I am contacting you as a local Muswell Hill business owner with two sites on Fortis Green Road, N103HN. Last year I wrote to the Council as Co-Chair of the Muswell Hill Traders Group (MHTG) setting out the concerns of our business owner members with the proposed increases. Much of what we raised then with the Council has, sadly, come to pass. It is pretty clear to most businesses that the last round of parking charge increases has had a negative effect on retail trade throughout Muswell Hill. In these difficult economic times with the Council budgets under pressure we can understand the need to look at all possible ways to increase Council income. Accordingly a reasonable rise in parking charges may well have appropriate and that was the position taken previously by the MHTG. What we are now faced with is a significant boycott by car owners who clearly feel the new charges are punitive as they are similar to West End charges and, wonderful though Muswell Hill may be, it is not the West End! If these shoppers were then walking into MH to do their shopping it may make the Council's case for such a rise – but they are simply moving their trade to the numerous out of town shopping centres nearby which offer free parking. The fee rise has been self defeating because with the decline in trade since the increases more and more local businesses are finding it difficult to pay their rates, or even survive! As I write this note there are five empty spaces in Fortis Green Road and that is a fairly average vacancy level with the corresponding drop in trade for our shops. Prior to the increase we rarely had one vacant parking space! We believe passionately in a thriving local shopping centre to serve our community and attract customers from far and wide. For this we need all the support we can get from our Council. Please be good enough to reconsider the current parking fees as one positive step towards reviving local businesses in this part of our Borough. I would welcome your views on this plea from the heart! Kind regards, Roger Ward CBE, MSc, AFS, FRSA, FCIPD. Chairman FEAST CATERING, FEAST DELI and FEAST ON THE HILL restaurant.

I am writing this email re the parking charges in Muswell Hill.

It has been brought to my attention that you did not receive the representation that we made, along side the TC chairs for Green Lanes and Crouchend, before the current prices were brought in. This is a surprise to me as the Muswell Hill Traders Group sent an email and we also urged our membership to do the same. We also attended meetings along side Crouch End and Green lanes to discuss the proposals. We were not pleased when the increase went ahead regardless.

To put it clearly at this point we strongly object to the level of increase in parking charges in Muswell Hill and throughout the borough. In the current retail climate we are fighting on every front for trade and the increased parking charges have caused a massive drop in trade.

Businesses in Muswell Hill not only serve our local community, whom we urge to walk to their local shops through initiatives such as our Green Is Good event last month, but also shoppers from Crouch End, Highgate, Hampstead and beyond. These shoppers must either use public transport - poorly served from the west - or drive their cars.

Businesses in Muswell Hill have seen a marked decrease in shoppers coming to the area as a direct result of the parking charges. Further more the two hour stop and shop scheme does not encourage the kind of shopping Muswell Hill is trying to promote. We wish customers to come to Muswell Hill and shop, stop for lunch and also browse shops they may not have come directly to use. The turn over time is too short and the prices prohibitive.

This has been eloquently demonstrated by the number of empty bays you can see daily throughout Muswell Hill.

The local high streets, as we know them, are dying and the MHTG feel that whilst we are making every effort to survive parking charge increases are making the battle harder. We urge you to reconsider the increase to a much fairer amount. We are not a naive group and understand an increase was necessary but we are very clear that the increase was way beyond that which the area can support.

We wish to be included in all consultations in order to give the Muswell Hill businesses a voice and to ensure the review is a fair and balanced consultation. Please can you let me know how and when the review is taking place.

We look forward to speaking to you on this issue. Many thanks

Emma Whittlestone
Operational Chair

for and on behalf of The Muswell Hill Traders Group
www.InMuswellHill.co.uk

Crouch End businesses

I am writing in response to the Business Parking Management Survey

Customers frequently tell us that they do not come to Crouch End so often anymore for two principle reasons;
because of the high parking charges, particularly when contrasted to the free parking offered by many supermarkets

- the confusing and ambiguous signage which results in many of them to getting parking tickets because they have inadvertently parked illegally when they thought they were safely parked. One particular comment that it is more difficult to park late afternoon because of the parking restrictions in force.

Customers are now using centres such as Haringey Arena and Tesco at Colney Hatch Lane because it avoids the twin problems of paying to park and penalty fines.

Research analysts such as Mintel consistently report a down turn of foot fall on the high street. I can confirm this experience as we are seeing a 7% reduction in footfall. Therefore as in my previous email dated I urge the council to not do anything that adversely effects the vitality of its own high streets and, consequently, encourages customers to shop at retail parks and Super stores.

With so much publicity around The Mary Portas high street report I believe that it is important that Haringey is seen to be supportive of its own high streets.

It is crucial that the vitality and employment in the high street is protected and no adverse action taken that may have an effect to increase shop closures and job losses: parking is an integral part of this mix.

Also attached my parking survey

Kind regards

Christopher